

Retrospective Analysis in the Monitoring and Performance Stage of the Traditional Market Relocation Policy in Pancur Batu District, Deli Serdang Regency

M. Yuan Affriansyah Lubis^{1*}, Siti Hazzah Nur R²

¹Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan, 20155, Indonesia

²Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan, 20155, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Traditional Market, Performance, Policy, Retrospective, Relocation

ABSTRACT

The relocation policy for traditional market traders in Pancur Batu is regulated under the Regent Regulation of Deli Serdang Regency Number 688 of 2012 concerning the Management of Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers, and Modern Stores. This study aims to conduct a retrospective analysis of the relocation policy for the traditional market in Pancur Batu, examining its implementation and impact. A descriptive qualitative approach was employed, utilizing interviews, observations, and document analysis to gather data on the policy's performance. The findings indicate that the Pancur Batu District Government is responsible for managing the Pancur Batu Traditional Market on Jalan Merdeka to enhance market organization and address public concerns. However, the relocation process faced challenges due to inconsistencies in policy implementation. According to Regent Regulation Number 27 of 2020 regarding the organizational structure and functions of the Deli Serdang Industry and Trade Office, the market sector formulated policies that did not align with its core responsibilities. Consequently, the relocation process lacked effectiveness, as the responsible authorities did not adequately oversee its execution. This study highlights the need for clearer regulatory alignment and improved coordination between governmental bodies to ensure effective market management and trader relocation policies.

Received: 01 January 2025

Accepted: 02 March 2025

2024 The Author(s): This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



*Corresponding Author: M. Yuan Affriansyah Lubis

Email: yuanmuhamad31@gmail.com

INTRODUCTION

Traditional market traders on the side of the road are considered illegal because their use of space is not in accordance with its designation, thus disrupting the public interest. Activities such as street vendors using the sidewalk or road as a place to trade, careless installation of billboards, littering, and careless crossing of the road are very disruptive to traffic and sometimes cause accidents or congestion.

Referring to the Regulation of the Regent of Deli Serdang Number 688 of 2012 concerning the Management of Traditional Markets, Places of Entertainment, and Modern Shops, one of the efforts to enforce this Regional Regulation is to implement a policy of relocation or appropriate placement for traders so that they occupy land designated for urban planning, such as the relocation imposed on street food and beverage traditional market traders in Pancur Batu District. The relocation of street traditional market traders is a policy widely chosen by district or city governments in organizing and managing street traditional market traders. However, in practice, the relocation policy often faces rejection from traditional market traders in the policy's target group.

The policy of relocating street traditional market traders is not just about moving the selling location from the old place to the new place, but also about moving people or traders with their diversity of aspects. Therefore, the policy of relocating street traditional market traders must be able to accommodate diversity, including the needs of street traditional market traders. It is in this context that their participation in the policy process of relocating street traditional market traders is important.

Pancur Batu Traditional Market is one of 33 traditional markets in Deli Serdang Regency. The Deli Serdang Regency Market Office manages the market's operational system. Built in 1980, it has a building area of 5914 m² and a total market area of 6522 m². The Pancur Batu traditional market has 5 flying stalls, 128 government-sponsored stalls, 88 self-help stalls, and 568 registered traders. The stalls are rented out to traders and paid for once a year by the market manager or the Deli Serdang Regency Market Office.

The Pancur Batu District Government is reorganizing the Pancur Batu Traditional Market on Jalan Merdeka to improve the city of Pancur Batu and address community concerns about Jalan Merdeka, as well as support the Deli Serdang Regency. The Pancur Batu District will pave and construct drainage for the area currently occupied by traders and secure the assets of the Deli Serdang Regency Government. The opening of Jalan Merdeka was carried out so that traders would no longer sell in that location starting September 8, 2022, and the solution was that traders in that location could sell at the lower tax because, so far, the lower tax has always been empty and only on weekends (Saturdays) that there are traders. However, dozens of traders are demanding that their place of sale not be evicted because they have been selling in the Pancur Batu traditional market for approximately 10 to 15 years. They depend on selling at Jalan Merdeka Pasar Pancur Batu for their livelihood. Some sell meatballs, porridge, vegetables, clothes, and so on.

The Pancur Batu Traditional Market causes traffic jams and creates a special chaos every Saturday during Pancur Batu Traditional Market Week. The Pancur Batu District Government is planning to reorganize and regulate the Pancur Batu traditional market area on Jalan Merdeka, which for years has been used as a place of sale by these traders. Pancur Batu District will hold a meeting to discuss evaluating the policy on reorganizing and controlling the Pancur Batu traditional market area, especially on Jalan Merdeka. In the policy, several problems occur in the field, namely the lack of performance of the office in following the main tasks and functions, causing losses to traders due to the decrease in income after the relocation. The asphaltting process and the construction of drains were not carried out according to their activities, and also on Jalan Merdeka, before the place where the traders sold, became a place for illegal parking.

The relocation policy came about because the government saw the potential of the traders at Parit 1 Jalan Nasional market to be able to provide income to the regional treasury through levies. This is because traders who choose to continue selling at the Parit 1 Jalan Nasional market are afraid of losing customers if they move from the market location. In fact, they realize that the existence of the market on Jalan Nasional is not feasible. However, they realize that the profits and their long presence in the area are reasons to persist and ignore the government's relocation plans. The purpose of this study is to find out and describe in depth the retrospective policy analysis of the traditional market in Pancur Batu. Based on this, the author was interested in conducting a research entitled "Retrospective Analysis of the Monitoring Phase and Performance of the Traditional Market Relocation Policy in Pancur Batu District, Deli Serdang Regency".

LITERATURE REVIEW

Public Policy

James E. Anderson in Irfan Islamy (2000) states, "Public Policy is a series of actions that have a specific purpose that is followed and carried out by a group of actors to solve a specific problem". Heinz Eulau and Kenneth Prewitt, 1973 in Leo Agustino (2006) define public policy as a fixed decision characterized by consistency and repetition of the behavior of those who make and obey the decision.

Pressman and Widavsky, as quoted by Budi Winarno (2002), define public policy as a hypothesis that contains initial conditions and predictable consequences. State that public policy has at least three interrelated dimensions, namely as an objective, as an authoritative choice of legal action, and as a hypothesis (Regif & Pattipeilohy, 2024).

Policy Analysis

According to Dunn (2003), policy analysis is an intellectual activity carried out in the political process. Policy analysis basically has three main points analyzing policy, according to Tangkilisan (2003), namely:

1. The main focus is on the explanation or recommendation of appropriate policies.
2. The causes and consequences of policies are investigated using scientific methodology.
3. Analysis is carried out to develop general theories that can be relied upon for policies and their formation and that can be applied to different institutions and policy areas.

Retrospective Policy Analysis

As Dunn (2003) explains, retrospective policy analysis is the creation and transformation of information after policy action has been taken. Based on the activities developed by this group of analysis, there are three types of retrospective analysis: discipline-oriented analysis, problem-oriented analysis, and application-oriented analysis. Of course, these three types of retrospective analysis have strengths and weaknesses.

The types of information relevant to policy (policy issues, policy performance, future policy, policy action, policy outcomes) are interrelated and interdependent. The arrows connecting each component of information illustrate the dynamic process by which one type of information is transferred to another using the appropriate analytical procedures (problem formulation, forecasting, recommendation, monitoring, and evaluation) (Lubis & Sari, 2024).

Public Service

Service according to Moenir (2010) says that service is the process of meeting needs through the direct activities of others. Meanwhile, the Minister of Administrative Reform (1993) argues that services in the form of goods and services are in the context of efforts to meet the needs of the community (Harbani Pasolong, 2010). Public services, according to Agung Kurniawan (2005), are the provision of services to meet the needs of others or the community who have an interest in the organization in accordance with established rules and procedures.

Public services or public services, according to Sadu Wasistiono (Hardiansyah 2011), is the provision of services by the government, the private sector on behalf of the government or the private sector to the community, with or without payment to meet the needs and or interests of the community. The provision of public services for the needs of organizations or communities that have an interest in the organization in accordance with the established rules and procedures; thus, public services fulfill the desires and needs of the community by the administration of the state.

Traditional Markets and Modern Markets

Traditional Markets and Modern Markets, Nordhaus (2000) states:

“A traditional market is a real market as defined by the market, where the goods being traded can be held by the buyer and allow for direct bargaining between the seller and the buyer. The goods traded in traditional markets are usually everyday necessities.”

Traditional markets can be categorized as local markets because they only reach certain areas with a narrow scope. Most traditional market traders do not keep records of sales, production costs, or other costs, and they are rarely calculated together (Asakdiyah, 2004). A traditional market is a market where sellers and buyers can bargain directly. The goods that are traded are necessities (Lufti, 2012). According to Wicaksono et al. (2008), traditional markets are places where sellers and buyers meet and are characterized by direct buyer-seller transactions. The buildings usually consist of stalls or booths, stalls, and open areas that the seller opens or a market manager.

The Concept of Relocation

The concept of relocation is a science that investigates the spatial arrangement of economic activities or the geographical allocation of potential resources, as well as their relationship to or influence the existence of various other economic and social businesses or activities. The location of various activities, such as households, shops, factories, farms, mines, schools, and places of worship, is not random but rather shows a pattern and arrangement that can be investigated and understood (Setyaningsih, 2014).

Relocation is moving from one place to a new place. Relocation is one form of local government policy that is included in revitalization activities. Revitalization in the Big Indonesian Dictionary (KBBI) means the process, method, and act of reviving something that was previously underpowered (Setyaningsih and Susilo, 2014).

METHODOLOGY

The research method used is a type of qualitative research that is descriptive. Munir (2013) states that the descriptive approach aims to describe the nature of something or phenomenon that is ongoing when the research is conducted and examine the causes of a particular phenomenon. Data collection techniques are a strategic step in research in obtaining data (Hardani, 2020). The data collection techniques in this study include primary data collection techniques and secondary data collection techniques. Primary data collection techniques consist of observation and in-depth interviews. Meanwhile, secondary data collection techniques consist of documentation and literature studies. The data analysis technique used is the data analysis technique from Miles and Huberman, namely data reduction, the presentation of data, and concluding/verification (Hardani, 2020).

RESULTS & DISCUSSION

Retrospective Analysis of Relocation Policy Structuring and Development of Pancur Batu Traditional Market

A retrospective policy analysis proposed by Dunn (2000) is the creation and transformation of information after policy action has been taken. There are 3 types of analysis based on activities developed by this group of analysis, namely discipline-oriented analysis, problem-oriented analysis,

and application-oriented analysis. Of course, these three types of retrospective analysis have advantages and disadvantages.

The researcher uses the Retrospective Analysis model, according to Dunn (2000), to describe the Retrospective Analysis of the Relocation Policy for the Arrangement and Development of the Pancur Batu Traditional Market, the five types of information relevant to policy (policy issues, policy performance, future of policy, policy action, policy outcomes) are interconnected and interdependent. The arrows connecting each component of information illustrate the dynamic process in which one type of information is transferred to another using the appropriate analytical procedures (problem formulation, monitoring, evaluation).

Problem Formulation

The problem formulation is the event or situation that starts, and the consequence is the result of the cause of the event or situation that has started. The cause of the merchant relocation policy was due to a lack of communication between the office and the sub-district, which caused a policy failure, as well as a lack of information about correspondence between the merchants, the market department of the trade and industry office, and the sub-district.

The Deli Serdang Regency Industry and Trade Office carries out the relocation and structuring of traditional markets based on the standards set forth in the Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 20 of 2012 concerning the Management and Empowerment of Traditional Markets, which is based on Presidential Regulation Number 112 of 2007 concerning the Structuring and Development of Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers and Modern Stores. This is due to the relocation of traders to the place where they are being relocated and they say they are following the existing regulations. However, what happens in the field is that they relocate traders without following the existing regulations. Based on the Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs number 20 of 2012, article 5, paragraph 2 states that the planning of traditional markets includes physical and non-physical planning. Article 6, paragraph 1 explains that physical planning includes;

1. Determination of location.
2. Provision of building facilities and market layout.
3. Supporting facilities.

Regulation of the Regent of Deli Serdang Number 34 of 2020 concerning the Position, Organizational Structure, Duties and Functions, and Work Procedures and Work Procedures of the sub-districts, Deli Serdang Regency, as explained by the Section and Peace and Public Order section of the Pancur Batu sub-district office.

“The role of the sub-district is to direct the community to follow local regulations governing the location of traders that have been prepared by the industry and trade office, namely in the lower tax area, but the community is resisting their relocation because they have business licenses as

implemented by Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 20 of 2012 in Article 13 and Regency Regulation, Deli Serdang Number 7 of 2015 concerning Public Peace and Order in Article 30 paragraphs 1 and 2." (Interview with Fajar Adhari Tambunan as the party concerned) Deli Serdang number 7 of 2015 concerning public peace and order in article 30, paragraphs 1 and 2. (Interview with Fajar Adhari Tambunan as the representative of the Pancur Batu sub-district for public peace and order, on June 6, 2024).

The sub-district carried out the task of the trade and industry agency in relocating traders. However, at that time, the traders refused to be relocated because they had permits that complied with the regulations. The problem with the policy on the relocation of traders or the transfer of traders on Jalan Merdeka to the lower tax area is the lack of communication between the Sub-District and the Trade and Industry Agency in the market sector. The policy has resulted in the rejection of traders on Jalan Merdeka who have been relocated to the lower tax area because they have had official business permits for many years, and they are still valid. However, they claimed to have been intimidated by irresponsible parties to immediately vacate their stalls and move to the lower tax area, resulting in a lack of income or profit from the policy. The Pancur Batu market thugs occupied Jalan Merdeka and engaged in illegal parking because the government never implemented the reorganization policy on Jalan Merdeka.

Monitoring

Monitoring is a main policy objective that has priority over other objectives for the actors. An intermediate objective of a policy is an objective that the actors strive to achieve with the intention of achieving a more distant objective (the final objective). Based on the results of the study, it is known that the Deli Serdang Regency Industry and Trade Office has implemented a policy of relocating traders based on the standards set out in the Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 20 of 2012 concerning the Management and Empowerment of Traditional Markets, with the aim and objective of the policy being to repair the damaged Merdeka road and build drainage on it. However, the community of traders who have been relocated to the lower tax area stated:

"My opinion is less in terms of their policy because they evicted us without a word and did not listen to us who had letters; how come the traders who sell without a permit in Pancur Batu market in another area were not evicted, and they were also not strict about the many illegal parking lots in this area of Pancur Batu market why in Jalan Merdeka they are disturbing the reorganization that is taking place there is nothing at all, in fact, there are more and more illegal parking lots and market thugs in the Pancur Batu market area" (interview with Johannes Tarigan as a trader on June 10, 2024)

The Deli Serdang Regency Government did not carry out its stated objective of relocating traders on Jalan Merdeka for the construction of drains or road repairs. The policy has been in place for more

than a year, but there has been no improvement at all. In fact, some of the land where they used to sell has become an illegal parking lot, and on weekends, it causes congestion on the road. There is also a lack of communication between the agency and the traders. The communication in the form of socialization carried out by the Deli Serdang Regency Industry and Trade Office as the implementer to the Pancur Batu Market traders and the community has not been effective. This is in accordance with the statement of Van Meter and Van Horn (Winarno, 2016: 136) that communication will run effectively if the size and objectives of the policy are understood by the individuals responsible for the policy's performance. The Deli Serdang Regency Industry and Trade Office, as the implementer, should act and play the role of an empathetic public communicator; thus, hopefully, the impression of being "government" when dealing with the public will not be apparent. The executor functions as a source or party that takes the initiative to communicate with the public/society, so the executor determines the role of all elements of the communication process so that the information conveyed can influence the public. Ultimately, the community feels that they are truly treated as citizens (Hardiyansyah, 2015).

Relocation planning, Trading, and structuring have not been carried out either, even though the community is more aware of and familiar with the condition of the Pancur Batu Market. Government policy objectives have also not been in line with the wishes of the community because they were moved to a less suitable place and did not provide good facilities for traders to be placed and renovated by the traders themselves rather than by the government.

Evaluation

Problem-solving, as proposed by According to Saad & Ghani (2008), problem-solving is a planned process that is then implemented in order to obtain a specific solution to the problem. Another opinion Polya (1973) states is that problem-solving is the effort to find a solution to a difficulty. The implementer has not yet disseminated information evenly to all traders on Jalan Merdeka, so there are still traders who do not know about the relocation and structuring policies. The rejection by traders of the relocation and structuring policies for traditional markets has also not been resolved properly. The implementer is forcing the relocation process by evicting traders from their places of business. The implementer also pays insufficient attention to the needs of traders in Jalan Merdeka, specifically in the Pancur Batu traditional market.

The policy of structuring and developing the Pancur Batu traditional market on Jalan Merdeka was carried out by a team from the Facilities and Distribution Actors Division of the Deli Serdang Regency Industry and Trade Office. The industry and trade office assigned the sub-district to organize, develop, and relocate the traders on Jalan Merdeka. However, the market department did not participate in implementing the policy assigned to them by the Pancur Batu sub-district. The Deli Serdang district government was found to violate "Presidential Regulation No. 112 of 2007 concerning the organization

and development of traditional markets, business centers, and modern shops", namely not considering the social conditions, the economic conditions of the community, and the transfer or relocation of traders to places that are less strategic and far from the social networks of the community when carrying out the arrangement and development of the Pancur Batu traditional market on Jalan Merdeka.

The traders felt the decline in the economy and in the number of visitors to buy their merchandise, which seemed deserted even on weekends and on weekdays, with only a few people crossing the area of the market below Pancur Batu. There were also fewer visits by the Deli Serdang Regency Government to the Jalan Merdeka area. There was a lack of communication between the Trade and Industry Agency and the sub-district and traders. The sub-district also had fewer visits to the Jalan Merdeka area. Moreover, this is not the fault of the entire Deli Serdang district government, but the traders should also have completed their business permit documents before the policy was implemented; the traders should have also extended their business permit documents, and if they did not have the permit documents, they should have made a report to the person who made the permit documents, so that there would be no misunderstanding between the trade and industry department and the sub-district and traders.

The solution to the problem is that traders are obliged to report to the sub-district office on the results of their economic improvement in the area of the under-the-rock-stone market so that their economic decline does not last long and show a valid Business Place Permit and also that they have extended the permit. Regarding the structuring and development of Jalan Merdeka, the community is obliged to report these problems to the Regent so that he can follow up on the performance of the Trade and Industry Agency and the sub-district so that traders can get an explanation of their rights on Jalan Merdeka so that this problem does not drag on and on and year after year they feel disadvantaged by those who are not responsible. The Deli Serdang Regency Government is considered not responsible for the policies it makes. These policies are not fully effective and cause losses to traders at the Pancur Batu Traditional Market, Deli Serdang Regency, precisely on Jalan Merdeka.

CONCLUSIONS

The relocation policy for traders at Pasar Pancur Batu on Jalan Merdeka encountered significant challenges in both the policy process and performance. The Deli Serdang Regency Government involved traders in the early stages of policy formulation, yet the implementation did not align with existing regulations. The primary objective was to repair Merdeka Road and build drainage, but the policy did not function effectively. Traders who had been selling on Merdeka Road for years were moved to the Bawah Pancur Batu market, where they experienced economic decline due to a lack of customers, with only a few daily transactions occurring.

Additionally, some traders had not extended their business licenses, further complicating their ability to operate. The trade and industry office failed to properly execute the policy, assigning tasks

to the sub-district head instead of directly overseeing implementation. The lack of effective supervision also led to market thugs occupying the vacated area and converting it into an illegal parking lot, undermining the original restructuring plan. Given these issues, the relocation policy has not been successful. Alternative approaches and stronger enforcement mechanisms are needed to ensure that trader relocation supports economic sustainability while achieving infrastructure improvements.

REFERENCE

- Agustino, Leo. (2006). *Dasar-dasar Kebijaksanaan Publik*. Bandung: CV. Alfabeta.
- Asakdiyah, Salamatus & Tina Sulistyani. (2004). Analisis Faktor-Faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Tingkat Pendapatan Pedagang Pasar Tradisional Di Kota Yogyakarta. *Jurnal Akutansi Dan Manajemen* Volume 15, Nomor 1, Hal. 55-65
- Ayu Setyaningsih, And Y.Sri Susilo. 2014. "Dampak Sosial Ekonomi Relokasi Pasar Satwa Pasar Satwa Dan Tanaman Hias Yogyakarta (Pasty) Tahun 2010-2014."
- Budi Winarno. (2005). *Teori dan Proses Kebijakan Publik*. Yogyakarta: Media
- Budi, Winarno. (2002). *Kebijakan Publik, Teori dan Proses*. Yogyakarta: Media Presindo.
- Dunn, William N. (2003). *Pengantar Analisa Kebijakan Publik*. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada Press.
- Dunn, William N., (2003), *Pengantar Analisis Kebijakan Publik*. Yogyakarta,
- Dye, Thomas R. (2008). *Understanding Public Policy, 12th Edition*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Education.
- Hardani, dkk (2020) *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif & Kuantitatif*. Yogyakarta: CV.Pustaka Ilmu Grup
- Hardiansyah, *Kualitas Pelayanan Publik (Konsep, Dimensi, Indikator dan Implementasinya)*, Konsep Pelayanan Publik, Yogyakarta: gavamedia, 2011.
- Herimanto dan Winarno, 2016, *Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Budaya*, PT. Bumi Aksara, Jakarta.
- Islamy, M. Irfan. 2000. *Prinsip-prinsip Perumusan Kebijakan Negara*. Jakarta. Sinar Grafika
- Lubis, A. S. A., & Sari, A. K. (2024). From Forest to Struggle Space: Social Mobilization and Environmental Policy Intervention by the Tano Batak Indigenous People of Sihaporas Village. *Wedy Journal of Multidisciplinary*, 1(2), 10–21. Retrieved from <https://jurnal.literasipublisher.co.id/index.php/wjm/article/view/66>
- Moenir, A.S. (2010). *Manajemen Pelayanan Umum Di Indonesia*. Jakarta.Bumi Aksara.
- Munir, (2013). *MULTIMEDIA dan Konsep Aplikasi Dalam Pendidikan*. Bandung: Penerbit Alfabeta.
- Musthofa, Z. 2011. *Evaluasi Pelaksanaan Porgram Relokasi Pemukiman Kumuh (Studi Kasus: Program Relokasi Pemukiman di Kelurahan Pucang Sawit Kecamatan Jebres Kota Surakarta)*.
- Pasolong, Harbani. (2010). *Teori Administrasi Publik*, Alfabeta, Bandung.
- Pasolong, Harbani. (2016). *Metode Penelitian Administrasi Publik*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Peraturan Bupati Deli Serdang Nomor 688 Tahun 2012 Tentang Pengelolaan Pasar Tradisional Pusat Perberlanjaan Dan Toko Modern
- Peraturan Bupati Deli Serdng Nomor 27 Tahun 2020 Tentang Kedudukan, Susunan organisasi, Tugas dan Fungsi Serta tata kerja Dinas Perindustrian Dan Perdagangan Kabupaten Deli Serdang
- Peraturan Daerah Kabupaten Deli Serdang nomor 7 Tahun 2015 Tentang Ketentraman Dan Ketertiban Umum.Peraturan Menteri Dalam Negeri Republik Indonesia Nomor 20 Tahun 2012 Tentang Pengelolaan dan Pemberdayaan Pasar Tradisional
- Peraturan Presiden Nomor 112 Tahun 2007 Tentang Penataan dan pembinaan Pasar tradisional, pusat pemberlanjaan dan toko modern
- Regif, S. Y., & Pattipeilohy, A. (2024). Quality of Public Services at the Kupang City Fire Office in Overcoming Fires. *Wedy Journal of Multidisciplinary*, 1(2), 1–9. Retrieved from <https://jurnal.literasipublisher.co.id/index.php/wjm/article/view/60>

- Saad, N.S. & Ghani, A. . (2008). *Teaching Mathematics in Secondary School: Theoris and Practices*. Perak: Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris.
- Sadono Sukirno, 2010, *Ekonomi Pembangunan : Proses, Masalah dan Dasar Kebijakan*, Kencana Prenada Media Group, Jakarta
- Samuelson, Paul dan Nordhaus William D. 2000. *Macro Economi*. Jakarta:
- Sugiyono. (2016). *Memahami Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Suharno. (2013). *Dasar-dasar Kebijakan Publik*. Yogyakarta: Ombak.
- Tangkilisan, HeselNogi. (2003). *Implementasi Kebijakan Publik*. Yogyakarta: Lukman
- Winarno, Budi. 2016. *Kebijakan Publik Era Globalisasi (Teori, Proses, dan Studi Kasus Komparatif)*. Yogyakarta: CAPC (Center of Academic Publishing Service)